



CITY of MEDINA Historic Preservation Board

Historic Preservation Board

Meeting Date: September 10, 2015

Meeting Time: 5:00 pm

Present: Paula Banks, Don Geitz, Leslie Traves, Gloria Brown, Justin Benko (Associate Planner), Sandy Davis (Administrative Assistant), Jonathan Mendel (Community Development Director)

Absent: Laura Parnell

Minutes: Don Geitz made a motion to approve the August 13, 2015 minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mrs. Banks.

Vote:

Geitz	<u>Y</u>
Banks	<u>Y</u>
Brown	<u>Y</u>
Traves	<u>abstain</u>
Approved	3-1

1. H15-20 117 W. Liberty Sully's COA

Mr. Mendel gave a brief overview of the case. Mr. Mendel stated this is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for façade rehabilitation at 117 W. Liberty Street, Sully's. Mr. Mendel stated the property is zoned C-2 Commercial and is located on the north side of W. Liberty Street in approximately the center of the block between N. Court St. and N. Elmwood St.

Mr. Mendel stated as part of the City's Downtown Revitalization Grant, the property owner is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the façade. Mr. Mendel stated the existing façade is composed of a storefront of wood and glazing installed in about 2007, the second and third floors predominantly covered in T-111 siding (manufactured wood siding) and two bay windows and currently covered third floor windows. Mr. Mendel stated it was discovered that under the siding is a buff brick.

Mr. Mendel stated the upper portions of the building will be restored and the storefront will be reconstructed which is deteriorating on the lower portion.

Mr. Mendel stated the buff brick was found on the upper levels of the building and the applicant intends to remove the existing façade material and restore the masonry. Mr. Mendel stated Section 145.07(3) of the City of Medina Codified Ordinances with respect to preservation/rehabilitation/renovation stated it is in the interest of the Board that buildings within the Historic District be preserved, thus maintaining the character of the Historic District. Mr. Mendel stated consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, the intent of these guidelines is to preserve and restore the features which establish a building's architectural character while making alterations and renovations necessary for the efficient and contemporary use of the building.

Mr. Mendel stated such alterations should be done so as not to destroy the materials and features which help to define a building's historic, cultural and/or architectural character. Mr. Mendel stated the historic materials, features and/or craftsmanship are important in defining the building character and should be retained, protected, and repaired when possible.

Mr. Mendel stated the proposed primary façade rehabilitation will expose and repair the original yellow buff brick on the upper (2nd and 3rd) floors. Mr. Mendel stated this will remove the currently deteriorating T-111 siding/inappropriate materials from one of the prominent remaining 'unrestored' facades in the Historic District. Mr. Mendel stated the relatively new storefront will be rebuilt in an appropriate manner consistent with the historical nature of the building.

Mr. Mendel stated the rehabilitation of the original façade will greatly add to the District and remove inappropriate façade finishes that are currently deteriorating.

Mr. Mendel stated no signage shown on the plans is under review at this meeting. Mr. Mendel stated all new signage requires review by the Historic Preservation Board and will be conducted through a separate application and review process.

Mr. Mendel stated staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project with the following conditions:

1. Subject to all necessary building permits from the City of Medina Building Department
2. No signage is approved as part of this review.

Mrs. Banks asked if the two upper windows exist under the T-111 siding. Mr. Mendel stated the owners have informed him that the windows are up there and they would be architectural affectations because the third floor is used for HVAC equipment for the lower levels. Mr. Mendel stated the windows are there but they would not be functional transparent windows. Mrs. Banks stated the upper windows make the building look more balanced.

Mrs. Traves asked if the stars on the historic photo of the building are still there. Mr. Mendel stated he thinks it is a presumption of the person who did the rendering that they would still be there. Mr. Mendel stated they may still be there but there was no investigation to find out. Mr. Mendel stated they may be tie backs for the façade behind the siding.

Mrs. Banks asked if the '1927' that is currently on the building is the age of the building. Mr. Mendel stated he does not know what that represents but the building is older than that.

Mr. Geitz asked what the side of the building looks like. Mr. Mendel stated the east and west sides of the building are painted brick.

Roger Smalley stated the Morris family came to the Main Street Design Committee and asked for help with colors and design aspects. Mr. Smalley stated they then reached out to the Community Design Committee. Mr. Smalley stated they looked at color schemes and contracted with a local artist to do the rendering. Mr. Smalley stated the building is brick on the sides and the brick is painted on the west side and is also painted on the east side but a different color. Mr. Smalley stated the building was found to be much older than 1927. Mr. Smalley stated this building has gone through many changes over the years.

Mark Morse, building owner, stated the building has been in his family for a very long time. Mr. Morse stated it has housed Medina Auto Parts. Mr. Morse stated there used to be gentlemen boarding rooms upstairs. Mr. Morse stated it was also Foster's Dry Cleaner, a Machine Shop, and now Sully's.

Mrs. Traves made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for façade renovations at 117 W. Liberty Street, Sully's, as presented, subject to the following:

1. Subject to all necessary building permits from the City of Medina Building Department
2. No signage is approved as part of this approval

The motion was seconded by Mrs. Banks.

Vote:	
Geitz	<u>Y</u>
Banks	<u>Y</u>
Traves	<u>Y</u>
Brown	<u>Y</u>
Approved	4-0

Mr. Benko gave a brief overview of the case. Mr. Benko stated this is a request for Conditional Sign Approval and a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior door replacement for 126 N. Court Street, Cups Café.

Mr. Benko stated the applicant has submitted a request for a new wall sign for Cups Café. Mr. Benko stated the new sign will be the same size, color, and design as the existing sign; however, raised lettering will be incorporated into the new sign. Mr. Benko stated the sign will be constructed of 3 mm max metal material. Mr. Benko presented color samples to the board.

Mr. Benko stated the applicant is also seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the exterior door on the north wall. Mr. Benko stated the current door and frame are exhibiting signs of deterioration. Mr. Benko stated the applicant proposes replacing the door and frame. Mr. Benko stated the new door will have a larger window and will be painted the same color as the building.

Mr. Benko stated the replacement of the door will improve the look of the north side of the building while alleviating a maintenance and safety issue at the site. Mr. Benko stated the door is not operable in its current state of deterioration.

Mr. Benko stated the size, color, and design of the new sign will remain largely the same; however, the incorporation of the 3D text will improve the overall look of the sign.

Mr. Benko stated the proposed sign will be compatible with the building and the district. Mr. Benko stated the replacement of the exterior door should improve the look of the north façade of the building.

Mr. Benko stated staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board grant a conditional sign approval for the proposed sign and also a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior door replacement.

Present for the case was Tim VanArsdale, Director of Cups Café. Mr. VanArsdale stated the new side door will be painted red the same as the brick in order to blend it into the north wall.

Mr. VanArsdale stated the logo and the verbiage will be raised 3 dimensional lettering on the sign.

Mr. Geitz made a motion to approve a Conditional Sign Permit for a new sign as submitted for 126 N. Court Street, Cups Café, and a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior door replacement at 126 N. Court Street, Cups Café as submitted.

The motion was seconded by Mrs. Brown.

Vote:
 Banks Y
 Traves Y
 Brown Y
 Geitz Y
 Approved 4-0

3. H15-22 39 E. Washington First Merit COA

Mr. Benko gave a brief overview of the case. Mr. Benko stated this is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 39 Public Square, for window replacement for the First Merit Bank building.

Mr. Benko stated the subject property is located on the southwest corner of Public Square.

Mr. Benko stated the windows at the site are wood single hung with one vertical grid. Mr. Benko stated the applicant proposes replacing the wood windows with Alcoa TR 9700 Historic Profiled Single Hung aluminum windows that feature insulated glass in the “colonial white” color. Mr. Benko stated visually, the windows will have a similar grid pattern to the existing windows.

Mr. Benko stated the proposed window change from wood single hung windows to Historic Profiled Single Hung aluminum windows will appear harmonious to the existing building and will be done in a manner that is respectful to the character of this defining building in the District. Mr. Benko stated the overall perceivable variation between the windows should be minimal. Mr. Benko stated there is varying levels of deterioration and peeling paint on the windows; once replaced, the need for maintenance will be minimized for the future.

Mr. Benko stated staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project with the following condition:

1. Subject to all necessary building permits from the City of Medina Building Department

Present for the case was Gordon (not sure of last name), with Jamieson Ricca Windows. Gordon presented a sample of the proposed window. Gordon stated there are some historic features to the window such as bevel return on the glass, exterior mutton profile to look like the original wood and a same bevel to the glass, a narrow meeting rail and an extended sill rail which gives the appearance of a wood window. Gordon stated it is aluminum for durability. Gordon stated the system is a window and an external aluminum piece that goes on the exterior to look like the brick mold that is existing on the building. Gordon presented the color options for the window and stated the bronze options were being discussed.

Gordon stated the window would be one color all over. Gordon stated there is currently a storm window on the outside and the original window is behind it. Gordon stated the existing window is a lighter white color. Gordon stated the storm windows would be removed and replaced with a window with one vertical member and an arch to match the window opening.

Randy Oswald from First Merit Bank stated the white color was suggested to adhere to the existing windows. Mr. Oswald stated they would be happy to use a bronze color or darker color.

Bill Lamb, Councilman At Large and Director of the Community Design Committee commented. Mr. Lamb stated the CDC has reviewed the window. Mr. Lamb stated the subject building is the second most important building on the square and in the history of the restoration of the square.

Mr. Lamb stated the CDC is satisfied with the window with the exception of the color. Mr. Lamb stated the original windows would have been a darker color and the CDC would recommend a darker color for the window. Mrs. Traves asked Mr. Lamb which bronze of the three choices the CDC would prefer. Mr. Lamb stated the "Classic Bronze".

Matt Weiderhold, Main Street Medina Executive Director, stated they echo the sentiments of the CDC. Mr. Weiderhold stated he would suggest the Classic Bronze also.

Mrs. Banks made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement for 39 Public Square, First Merit Bank subject to all necessary building permits from the City of Medina Building Department and the windows be the "Classic Bronze" color.

The motion was seconded by Mrs. Traves.

Vote:

Geitz	<u>Y</u>
Brown	<u>Y</u>
Traves	<u>Y</u>
Banks	<u>Y</u>
Approved	4-0

4. H15-23 100 Public Square Birch Family Ltd. COA

Mr. Mendel gave a brief overview of the case. Mr. Mendel stated this is a request from Birch Family LTD for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new storefront at 100 Public Square.

Mr. Mendel stated the subject property is located on the northwest corner of the Public Square and N. Broadway Street.

Mr. Mendel stated the applicant is proposing a new storefront on the east façade of the subject building(former PNC Bank building). Mr. Mendel stated the project involves the replacement of the upper story windows in the remainder of the east façade. Mr. Mendel stated these windows were removed and the openings bricked up sometime in the past.

Mr. Mendel stated the proposed façade changes are due to interior changes to the interior layout of the building. Mr. Mendel stated the applicant has a tenant for the south half of the ground floor which will be accessed from the existing storefront. Mr. Mendel stated this split creates a ground floor space at the rear (north) end of the building without formal access/visibility at the building's exterior. Mr. Mendel stated the applicant proposes creating the storefront to provide a formal entry for the proposed tenant space to the N. Broadway frontage.

Mr. Mendel stated this will create a space in the back of the ground floor without access or visibility from the buildings exterior. Mr. Mendel stated the applicant proposes creating the new storefront on the east façade of the building to be used for access to the new tenant space on the ground floor in the rear, and also the access for the residential unit which is a one bedroom apartment.

Mr. Mendel provided color cut sheets to the board. Mr. Mendel stated the proposed storefront interacts well with the existing building and fits into the 'language ' of the existing detailing and façade composition.

Mr. Mendel stated adding additional diversity to the Broadway streetscape helps break up the vast blank wall that currently exists. Mr. Mendel stated the main architectural features of the façade is the brick pilasters and inset wall planes running the length of the façade.

Mr. Mendel stated the proposed storefront fits well within three of these inset wall planes without interrupting decorative brick work and only minimally interrupting the brick pilasters.

Mr. Mendel stated the proposed replacement of the upper story windows in the south half of the east façade replace architectural elements that date back to the historical building configuration.

Mr. Mendel stated the specific materials and colors for the proposed windows and canopy are internally complimentary and match well with the building's brown brick.

Mr. Mendel stated staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project with the following condition:

1. Subject to all necessary building permits from the City of Medina Building Department

Present for the case was building owner, Megan Harbath. Mrs. Brown asked for clarification of the rendering. Ms. Harbath stated there is an awning, not a balcony in the rendering. Ms. Harbath stated the door is the only feature on the eastern portion of the building now. Ms. Harbath stated the public cannot enter through that door.

Ms. Harbath stated handicap can come in the front on there will be ADA accessibility on the western portion of the building. Ms. Harbath stated there will be three entrances with two exit points from all three suites, the front retail suite, the back retail or office suite, and the upstairs residential suite.

Ms. Harbath stated it is directly south of the Baptist Church.

Mr. Mendel stated there is no intent to paint the canopy for the Baptist Church, it is just the architect rendering. Mr. Mendel stated the half wing walls will remain.

Ms. Harbath stated they will be adding a nice residential unit on the square which there is a market for.

Ms. Harbath the upper windows were bricked in. Ms. Harbath stated the front ceiling on the interior has been opened up for a two story lobby.

Ms. Harbath stated the large red maple tree will remain.

Mrs. Banks made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for 100 Public Square, for a new storefront as submitted, subject to obtaining all necessary building permits from the City of Medina Building Department.

The motion was seconded by Mrs. Brown.

Vote:

Geitz	<u>Y</u>
Brown	<u>Y</u>
Traves	<u>Y</u>
Banks	<u>Y</u>
Approved	4-0

5. H15-24 115 W. Liberty Cupcake A Day COA

Mr. Mendel gave a brief overview of the case. Mr. Mendel stated this is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for façade painting at 115 W. Liberty Street, Cupcake A Day.

Mr. Mendel stated the site is located on the north side of W. Liberty between N. Court St. and N. Elmwood St.

Mr. Mendel stated as part of the Downtown Revitalization Grant, the applicant wishes to paint portions of the building façade (cornice, storefront and windows). Mr. Mendel stated the paint job will consist of “Crisp Linen”, “Mariner”, “Reclining Green”, “Maxi Teal” and “Black Bean”. Mr. Mendel stated these colors will be used on the exterior as shown on the plan submitted.

Mr. Mendel stated the proposed painting scheme will provide more diversity to the façade elements and extenuate the façade detailing while also maintaining its unity.

Mr. Mendel stated Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the building painting.

Bill Lamb, Councilman at Large and Executive Director of the Community Design Committee spoke. Mr. Lamb stated colors are a personal thing but in the context of the Historic Downtown Restoration, colors are very important. Mr. Lamb stated the CDC will do renderings for any business in the Historic District. Mr. Lamb stated they have a library of color suggestions that can be applied to a rendering for a visual guide to color free of charge.

Mr. Lamb offered that service to the applicant. Mr. Lamb stated black is not a historic color. Mr. Lamb stated he is commenting on the Huth & Harris building as well.

Megan Harbath asked if the CDC matches the colors to the age of the building or to compliment the colors of the buildings on the square. Mr. Lamb stated it is a little of both.

Present for the case was Eric Schultz and Joan Pritchett. Ms. Pritchett stated Mr. Schultz did the design. Ms. Pritchett stated she is happy to take Mr. Lamb's assistance from the CDC and would consider their suggestions.

Mrs. Banks stated the paint brings out the dental mouldings and details of the trimwork.

Mr. Schultz would like to move forward with approval as submitted and seek advise from the CDC afterwards.

Mrs. Traves made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for façade painting at 115 W. Liberty Street, Cupcake A Day, as submitted.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Geitz.

Vote:	
Geitz	<u>Y</u>
Brown	<u>Y</u>
Traves	<u>Y</u>
Banks	<u>Y</u>
Approved	4-0

Mr. Benko gave a brief overview of the case. Mr. Benko stated this is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 221 S. Court Street, Huth & Harris Wine Merchants, for the exterior façade painting.

Mr. Benko stated the storefront is located on the west side of S. Court Street, south of W. Washington Street and north of W. Smith Road.

Mr. Benko stated the applicant, H2 Wine Merchants, is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint the exterior of the storefront. Currently the exterior is mauve with faded purple trim; the applicant proposes painting the exterior and trim black. Color were provided to the board.

Mr. Benko stated the painting of the exterior façade will be consistent with the district. Mr. Benko stated the painting of the exterior should renew the look of the storefront. Mr. Benko stated the use of the black should provide a nice contrast with the cream colored signs.

Mr. Benko stated Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board grant a certificate of appropriateness for painting of the exterior.

Present for the case was part owner, Patrick Huth. Mr. Huth stated the doors are currently black. Mr. Huth stated the trim that would be painted is only approximately 20% of the overall surface area of the front of the building, of which 10% of it is already black.

Mrs. Banks stated the rendering looks like a soft charcoal grey which would not be so stark. Mr. Geitz stated this is really dark. Mr. Huth asked what the objective is. Mr. Huth stated this color is their preference and was carefully thought out.

Mr. Huth stated the color is black but the rendering looks grey. Mrs. Banks stated she feels the black will lose the architectural details that are over and under the windows and at the top of the building. Mr. Huth brought a photo of a store in another city that is high end and is painted black. Mr. Huth stated it is a fairly common color in other cities.

Mr. Lamb stated the applicant could paint the detailing in a slightly different tone such as a shade lighter than the black. Mr. Lamb stated it is the owner's choice.

Mrs. Traves asked how to keep the building from getting lost and will stand out so it can get business. Mr. Lamb stated the existing color blends in with the brick right now which makes the building blend in. Mr. Lamb stated he would suggest approving the request as it is and take a look at some possible accents.

Mr. Huth stated he would consider other color shades for contrast.

Mrs. Traves made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior painting at 221 S. Court Street, Huth & Harris Wine Merchants as submitted.

The motion was seconded by Mrs. Brown.

Vote:	
Geitz	<u>Y</u>
Brown	<u>Y</u>
Traves	<u>Y</u>
Banks	<u>Y</u>
Approved	4-0

Having no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Sandy Davis

Sandy Davis

Paula Banks, Co. Chair

~~Gloria Brown, Chairperson~~

Paula Banks, Vice-Chairperson