

MEETING DATE: 7-11-19

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION
BOARD**

**Case No. H19-08
117 E Liberty**



CITY of MEDINA
Historic Preservation Board
July 11, 2019 Meeting

Case No: H19-08 (continued from June 13, 2019)
Address: 117 E. Liberty St.
Applicant: Illes Architects representing The Odd Fellows
Subject: Certificate of Appropriateness – Storefront renovation
Zoning: C-2, Central Business
Submitted by: Jonathan Mendel, Community Development Director 

Background:

At the June 13, 2019, the HPB reviewed a renovation plan for the subject site's storefront.

The HPB reviewed the proposed plan, staff analysis and comments from the community. The outcome of this review involved the following comments and suggestions:

1. Perform strategic exploratory demolition of the existing façade to determine the existence and/or condition of extant portions of the original storefront as shown in available earliest historical photographic evidence of the subject building in order to determine feasibility of preservation and/or rehabilitation and incorporation of design elements and materials that remain.
2. If it is determined that no substantive portions of the original storefront design and materials are extant under the existing façade or they do exist, but are not able to be rehabilitated, the applicant will study the available earliest historical photographic evidence of the subject building to determine whether to incorporate, through replication, detail design and materials in the proposed renovation.
3. The white subway tile on the new storefront bulkheads and the fluted pilasters should be reconsidered.

Project introduction:

Since the June 13, 2019 meeting, the applicant performed an exploratory investigation under the existing façade and found no remnants of the early historical storefront materials or structure. The existing underlying storefront's structure is an uncoordinated combination of materials and composition that don't represent quality construction nor are internally unified for preservation purposes. The applicant will provide photo evidence of their exploration prior to the meeting in order to explain their proposed renovation.

The applicant's revised storefront renovation plan has removed the fluted pilasters on the storefront piers, changed to black ceramic glazed tile for the new storefront bulkheads and changed the finished detailing of the storefront piers to incorporate simplified paneled sections.

Sample materials will be brought to the meeting for review.

Attached to this report:

1. Revised building elevation renovation plan received June 27, 2019

Considerations:

The City of Medina Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts

Section 145.07(a) of the City of Medina Codified Ordinances desires, with respect to preservation/rehabilitation/renovation generally, it is the interest of the Board that buildings within the Historic District be preserved, thus maintaining the character of the Historic District. Consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior, Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, the intent of these Guidelines is to preserve and restore the features which establish a building's architectural character while making alterations and renovations necessary for the efficient and contemporary use of the building.

The renovation process assumes that some alterations may be necessary to meet the needs of the building owner and the health, safety, and welfare of the building occupants. Such alterations should be done so as not to destroy the materials and features which help to define a building's historic, cultural and/or architectural character. The historic materials, features and/or craftsmanship are important in defining the building character and should be retained, protected, and repaired when possible.

Staff Analysis:

The applicant has provided a revised storefront renovation plan. As with the earlier iteration of the plan, it must be compared with the following design guidelines outlined in the *City of Medina Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts*. The following guidelines are applicable specifically to commercial storefront projects. Staff comments to each applicable guideline is provided in non-italics:

Missing Element

- *Replace or reconstruct the missing element using materials that match the original as closely as possible.*

The applicant has conducted an exploratory investigation of the existing storefront and discovered there are no portions remaining of the original storefront finished materials or design.

- *If no evidence can be found to document the element's original appearance, replacement should be consistent with the building's size, scale, and materials. The replacement should be simplified in order to avoid creating an elaborate detail that may not have been part of the original design.*

The revised renovation plan dispensed with the fluted pilasters on the storefront piers and now proposes simplified panel detailing for the piers similar to the paneled piers shown in the available historical photos.

- *Examining other buildings of the same architectural style can help determine what may be appropriate.*

The storefront at Ormandy's Trains and Toys (10 S. Court St.), which is an early 20th Century commercial building similar in period to the subject building, has painted glazed steel tiles covering the storefront bulkheads and piers, but are not likely original to the building.

Deteriorated Element

- *Repair of deteriorated historic elements should not alter the appearance of the storefront. Repair deteriorated elements as soon as possible to prevent further damage or loss of material.*
- *If a historic element is deteriorated beyond repair and removal has been approved, document with photographs and measurements before removal. Then reproduce the element, matching the original design and materials.*

The revised plan harkens to the past design details of the earliest storefront design with the paneled storefront piers.

Non-original Element

- *If an element has been previously replaced, consider retaining the existing element if it is unique, aesthetically complements the building, or is a good example of what was in style in its own time (i.e., a well-designed and constructed 1920s storefront in an 1870s commercial building).*
- *If the element is considered inappropriate for the building, replace the element with one that is acceptable.*

The existing façade materials and individual storefronts are not original to the building and do not represent good examples of the time period in which they were constructed nor do they aesthetically complement the remainder of the building. Removal through a renovation project will not be detrimental to the building or the Historic District.

Staff Comment:

As stated at the June 13, 2019 meeting, a renovation is warranted due to the beginning deterioration and inappropriateness of the existing façade materials. The first plan had some details that were in question and the applicant hadn't performed an exploratory investigation of the existing façade to determine the extent of remaining original design and materials.

Now the applicant has performed this investigation and found nothing worth preserving and also revised the renovation plan to simplify the storefront pier detailing, the revised plan will be a welcome change to the subject property and the District.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board **approve** a storefront renovation plan (received June 27, 2019) for 117 E. Liberty St with the following condition:

1. Subject to all necessary building permit reviews by the City of Medina Building Department.

RECEIVED
JUN 27 2019
By *Am*





copper

white
dark
bronze

white trim
panels

black
glass tile
w/white
grout

white starfront alum

matblack tile 2019
octagon floor tile

RECEIVED
JUN 27 2019
By *[Signature]*

ELEVATION REVISIONS

Scale 1/4"=1'-0"



SK-2